

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

An International Journal

VOL. 9 NO. 2

EDITOR'S FAREWELL ..... *Sofia Gruskin*

## SPECIAL FOCUS: RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES TO HEALTH

RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES TO HEALTH: Something for Everyone .. *Sofia Gruskin*

### Field Research

HEALTH, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND MALARIA CONTROL:

Historical Background and Current Challenges..... *Paula E. Brentlinger*

IDENTIFYING THE LINKS BETWEEN VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN AND HIV/AIDS:

Ecosocial and Human Rights Frameworks Offer Insight into US Prevention Policies  
..... *Michelle Teti, Mariana Chilton, Linda Lloyd, and Susan Rubinstein*

INVOKING HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS TO ENSURE ACCESS TO LEGAL ABORTION:

The Case of a Nine-Year-Old Girl from Nicaragua. . . *Heathe Luz McNaughton Reyes,  
Charlotte E. Hord, Ellen M. H. Mitchell, and Marta Maria Blandon*

HUMAN RIGHTS ABUSES AND VULNERABILITY TO HIV/AIDS: The Experiences of  
Burmese Women in Thailand..... *Karen Leiter, Voravit Suwanvanichkij,  
Ingrid Tamm, Vincent Iacopino, and Chris Beyrer*

SELECTIVE ADAPTATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS TO HEALTH IN CHINA

..... *Lesley Jacobs and Pitman B. Potter*

THE PERUVIAN TRUTH COMMISSION'S MENTAL HEALTH REPARATIONS:

Empowering Survivors of Political Violence to Impact Public Health Policy

..... *Lisa J. Laplante and Miryam Rivera Holguin*

EVALUATING ASYLUM SEEKERS/TORTURE SURVIVORS IN URBAN PRIMARY CARE:

A Collaborative Approach at the Bronx Human Rights Clinic

..... *Ramin G. Asgary, Eva E. Metalios, Clyde L. Smith, and Gerald A. Paccione*

### Paradigms

BALANCING PROTECTION AND PRAGMATISM: A Framework for

NGO Accountability in Rights-Based Approaches

..... *Susannah Mayhew, Megan Douthwaite, and Michael Hammer*

DEVELOPING A MEASURE OF DIGNITY FOR STRESS-RELATED HEALTH OUTCOMES

..... *Mariana Chilton*

MODELS OF RESISTANCE: "Victims" Lead ..... *Theresa M. McGovern*

ACCOUNTABILITY FOR THE HEALTH CONSEQUENCES OF HUMAN RIGHTS

VIOLATIONS: Methodological Issues in Determining Compensation

..... *Mey Akashah and Stephen P. Marks*

MAKING THE GRADE: A First Attempt at a Health and Human Rights Report Card

..... *Dabney P. Evans, Megan E. Price, Tarun L. Gulrajani, and Alan R. Hinman*

### Report

HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN ACADEMIC SETTINGS

..... *Daniel Tarantola and Sofia Gruskin*



HARVARD SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH

François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for  
Health and Human Rights

Founded through support of the Association François-Xavier Bagnoud

## François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights

The François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights was founded at the Harvard School of Public Health in January 1993. The Center considers the promotion and protection of health and the promotion and protection of human rights to be inextricably linked and is dedicated to exploring the conceptual dimensions and practical applications of this critical relationship. Through its concentrated focus on the intersection of health and human rights, the Center also seeks to help revitalize the field of public health and broaden human rights thinking and practice. The Center offers numerous courses on health and human rights at Harvard and around the world, and Center staff publish widely in the field.

## Harvard School of Public Health

The Harvard School of Public Health includes more than 200 faculty members working in various disciplines of public health. The overriding mission of the School — to advance the public's health through learning and discovery — comprises four objectives: to provide the highest level of education to public health scientists, practitioners and leaders; to foster new discoveries leading to improved health for the people of the United States and all nations; to strengthen health capacities and services for communities; and to inform policy debate, disseminate health information, and increase awareness of public health as a public good and fundamental right.

## Association François-Xavier Bagnoud

Since its founding in 1989, the Association François-Xavier Bagnoud (AFXB) has been a leading innovator and pioneer in the fight against HIV/AIDS and the formulation of low-cost solutions to care for those infected and affected by the virus. AFXB works with the conviction that the inextricable link between health and human rights is a key to sustainable development. It currently supports worldwide programs of prevention and treatment, basic education, and nutrition support and advocates for those who have neither the voice nor the power to affect change: namely the children, especially all orphans and vulnerable children. The Association François-Xavier Bagnoud bears the name of a young Swiss rescue pilot who died in a helicopter accident while flying over the desert in Mali in 1986.

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

## An International Journal

VOL. 9 NO. 2

EDITOR'S FAREWELL .....1  
*SOFIA GRUSKIN*

### **SPECIAL FOCUS: RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES TO HEALTH**

RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES TO HEALTH: SOMETHING FOR EVERYONE. . . .5  
*SOFIA GRUSKIN*

### **Field Research**

HEALTH, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND MALARIA CONTROL: HISTORICAL  
BACKGROUND AND CURRENT CHALLENGES. . . . .10  
*PAULA E. BRENTLINGER*

IDENTIFYING THE LINKS BETWEEN VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN  
AND HIV/AIDS: ECOSOCIAL AND HUMAN RIGHTS FRAMEWORKS  
OFFER INSIGHT INTO US PREVENTION POLICIES. . . . .40  
*MICHELLE TETI, MARIANA CHILTON, LINDA LLOYD, AND SUSAN RUBINSTEIN*

INVOKING HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS TO ENSURE ACCESS TO LEGAL  
ABORTION: THE CASE OF A NINE-YEAR-OLD GIRL FROM NICARAGUA . . . 62  
*HEATHE LUZ MCNAUGHTON REYES, CHARLOTTE E. HORD,  
ELLEN M. H. MITCHELL, AND MARTA MARIA BLANDON*

HUMAN RIGHTS ABUSES AND VULNERABILITY TO HIV/AIDS: THE  
EXPERIENCES OF BURMESE WOMEN IN THAILAND . . . . .88  
*KAREN LEITER, VORAVIT SUWANVANICHKIJ, INGRID TAMM,  
VINCENT IACOPINO, AND CHRIS BEYRER*

SELECTIVE ADAPTATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS TO HEALTH IN CHINA . . . 112  
*LESLEY JACOBS AND PITMAN B. POTTER*

THE PERUVIAN TRUTH COMMISSION'S MENTAL HEALTH REPARATIONS:  
EMPOWERING SURVIVORS OF POLITICAL VIOLENCE TO IMPACT PUBLIC  
HEALTH POLICY. . . . .136  
*LISA J. LAPLANTE AND MIRYAM RIVERA HOLGUIN*

EVALUATING ASYLUM SEEKERS/TORTURE SURVIVORS IN URBAN PRIMARY CARE:  
A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH AT THE BRONX HUMAN RIGHTS CLINIC. . . . 164  
*RAMIN G. ASGARY, EVA E. METALIOS, CLYDE L. SMITH, AND  
GERALD A. PACCIONE*

### **Paradigms**

BALANCING PROTECTION AND PRAGMATISM: A FRAMEWORK FOR  
NGO ACCOUNTABILITY IN RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES. . . . .180  
*SUSANNAH MAYHEW, MEGAN DOUTHWAITE, AND MICHAEL HAMMER*

DEVELOPING A MEASURE OF DIGNITY FOR STRESS-RELATED  
HEALTH OUTCOMES. . . . .208  
*MARIANA CHILTON*

MODELS OF RESISTANCE: "VICTIMS" LEAD . . . . .234  
*THERESA M. MCGOVERN*

ACCOUNTABILITY FOR THE HEALTH CONSEQUENCES OF HUMAN RIGHTS  
VIOLATIONS: METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES IN DETERMINING COMPENSATION . . 256  
*MEY AKASHAH AND STEPHEN P. MARKS*

MAKING THE GRADE: A FIRST ATTEMPT AT A HEALTH AND  
HUMAN RIGHTS REPORT CARD . . . . .280  
*DABNEY P. EVANS, MEGAN E. PRICE, TARUN L. GULRAJANI,  
AND ALAN R. HINMAN*

### **Report**

HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN ACADEMIC SETTINGS. . . . 297  
*DANIEL TARANTOLA AND SOFIA GRUSKIN*

*Health and Human Rights* is a peer-reviewed international journal dedicated to studying the relationships between human rights and health. The journal examines the effects of human rights violations on health; the impacts of health policies on human rights; and the inextricable nature of the relationship between the promotion and protection of health and the promotion and protection of human rights.

#### **PUBLICATION POLICY**

*Health and Human Rights* welcomes unsolicited manuscripts. Authors should send their manuscripts to the Editorial Office at the address below. Guidelines for authors can be found in the back of this issue and at [www.hsph.harvard.edu](http://www.hsph.harvard.edu) or obtained by writing to the Editorial Office. Issues of international impact and significance for health and human rights are of particular interest.

Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of *Health and Human Rights* officers, editors, or other members.

#### **EDITORIAL/SUBSCRIPTION OFFICE**

*Health and Human Rights*  
Harvard School of Public Health  
François-Xavier Bagnoud Building  
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor  
Boston, MA 02115, USA  
[fxbcenter@igc.apc.org](mailto:fxbcenter@igc.apc.org)  
[www.hsph.harvard.edu/fxbcenter/journal](http://www.hsph.harvard.edu/fxbcenter/journal)  
Tel: (1) 617.432.4139  
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310

#### **ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING**

*Health and Human Rights* is abstracted and indexed in ASSIA: *Applied Social Science Index and Abstracts*, *Geographical Abstracts: Human Geography*, *International Bibliography of the Health Sciences*, *International Development Abstracts*, *A Matter of Fact*, *MEDLINE*, *PAIS International*, *Periodica Islamica*, *Social Planning/Policy and Development Abstracts*, and *Sociological Abstracts*.

*Health and Human Rights* is published twice a year.

---

#### **SUBSCRIPTION AND PURCHASE RATES** (in U.S. dollars)

	2 issues (1 year)	4 issues (2 years)
Students	\$40	\$70
Individuals	\$60	\$110
Institutions	\$120	\$230

#### **Individual Sponsorship \$40/\$60/\$120**

[Sponsorship helps subsidize free distribution in developing countries.]

Individuals in developing countries may qualify for a free 4-issue subscription by writing a letter of request to the Subscription Office.

Single and back issues are \$15, including postage.

**POSTAGE:** US, add \$10/1 year or \$20/2 years; all foreign, add \$20/1 year or \$40/2 years.

---

*Health and Human Rights* (ISSN 1079-0969) is published by the François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights of the Harvard School of Public Health.



*This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/ISO Z39.48-1992  
(Permanence of paper)*

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

## Editor

Sofia Gruskin

## Senior Advisory Board

Philip Alston  
Hina Jilani  
Halfdan Mahler

V. Ramalingaswami  
Henry Steiner  
Katarina Tomaševski

## Editorial Board

Sunila Abeysekera  
Manuel Carballo  
Lincoln Chen  
Ernest Drucker  
Paul Epstein  
Richard Feachem  
Harvey Fineberg  
Julio Frenk  
H. Jack Geiger  
Lawrence Gostin  
Mirko D. Grmek  
Timothy Harding  
Aart Hendriks  
Hakima Himmich  
Emmanuel Hirsch  
Howard Hu  
Peter Kandela  
Michael D. Kirby  
Slobodan Lang  
John F. Lauerman  
Maureen Law  
Jennifer Leaning

Ana Luisa Liguori  
Adetokunbo O. Lucas  
Stephen P. Marks  
Gerald Nagler  
Aryeh Neier  
Richard Parker  
Geneviève Pinet  
Peter Piot  
Jacqueline Pitanguy  
Olikoye Ransome-Kuti  
Jon E. Rohde  
Renée Sabatier  
Amartya Sen  
Gracelyn Smallwood  
Margaret A. Somerville  
Eric Stover  
Donna Sullivan  
Daniel Tarantola  
Lorenzo Tomatis  
Nahid Toubia  
Laurie Wiseberg

## Founding Editor

Jonathan Mann 1947–1998

**Assistant Editors:** Lynn Martin (through June 2006)

Kelly Safreed Harmon (from July 2006)

**Design and Production Assistance:** Catlin Rockman

**Layout and Editorial Assistance:** Nick Thorkelson

**Copy Editing Assistance:** Ann Barger Hannum

**Proofreading:** Dina Bogecho